

## **PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD**

**MONDAY, JULY 26, 2004**

**3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II**

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Chatterjee, Kirk, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser, Sullebarger, Spraul-Schmidt and Wallace present. Absent: Bloomfield

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1212 JACKSON STREET AND ZONING VARIANCES, OVER-THE RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Ms. Sullebarger recused her self since she is a consultant to the applicant. Urban Conservator William Forwood presented the staff report for application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of these industrial buildings to house the Art Academy of Cincinnati. He stated the Shillito and Penbrooke building had been reviewed previously by the HCB for a T-Zone approval for an art college use and zoning variances for signage, under an address of 22 E. 12<sup>th</sup> Street.

Mr. Forwood indicated that this project has been submitted to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office for certification for historic tax credits. The Board would not normally review a project approved for tax certification. The tax review has taken longer than expected, so the applicant has decided to apply separately for a COA in order to secure permits.

Mr. Forwood stated work to the outside of the building includes the construction a rooftop winter garden and a new entry on Jackson Street as well as new windows and masonry work. Staff has determined that the rehabilitation and additions outlined in the staff report meets the Over-the-Rhine Historic District guidelines. Two items – the erection of a ten-foot high chain link fence and the installation of two temporary construction signs will require zoning variances.

Mr. Senhauser stated that the 10 x 30 construction sign proposed was more a billboard than a building sign and would not be acceptable; the Board agreed. Mr. Forwood indicated that staff was recommending that the present sign announcing the arrival of the Art Academy remain and that a single, smaller construction sign be installed on the Jackson Street façade. Alternately, the existing banner sign on 12<sup>th</sup> Street could be modified to include the names of the contractor, architect and lender, but should remain primarily an announcement sign; it could not be increased in size. Mr. Forwood explained that a zoning variance would be probable, if the Department of Buildings & Inspections determines that the existing banner is a construction sign. Staff was not recommending approval of the larger construction banner as proposed.

Project architect, Tim Liebel of Design Collective, Brian Lecon of Miller Valentine Group and preservation consultant Beth Sullebarger were present to answer questions from the Board.

Mr. Senhauser referred to a letter from Ms. Judith Kitchen (who is reviewing the Tax Act application for the Ohio Historic Preservation Office) included in the staff report regarding the status of the review. Ms. Sullebarger acknowledged that the Tax Act review

was independent from the Board's consideration. She proceeded to address each of the items listed and the measures taken to date.

Ms. Sullebarger stated that the design has not substantially changed from earlier schemes presented to the Board. She indicated that although a new entryway will be constructed on Jackson Street, the plan now provides for retaining the 12<sup>th</sup> Street entry (as a secondary access). In answer to Mr. Kreider, Mr. Liebel stated that the Barrelhouse would continue to use the adjacent loading dock.

Mr. Senhauser said that the roof-mounted mechanical equipment and skylights created a rooftop village that might be more logically organized. Mr. Kreider expressed concern that although the equipment would be shielded from immediate street view, it will be more highly visible from the north and east; he suggested screening. Mr. Kirk was concerned that additional screening would increase the size and visibility of the varied boxes. Mr. Liebel explained that the rooftop equipment had been positioned to relate to the structure of the building and the areas served, but the effect might be softened with color.

Mr. Liebel said that for security reasons the plan calls for a 10 foot chain link fence surrounding the generator on the east side of the site. Ms. Sullebarger stated there are other chain link fences in the area and that this one would not be highly visible from the street. It was agreed that a height of 8 feet would be sufficient and acceptable if colored black.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Raser with amendments, Sullebarger abstaining), to take the following actions:

1. Grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the adaptive reuse of 1212 Jackson Street with the condition that final plans and any revisions are submitted to the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit. Appropriate consideration should be given to mitigating the visual effect of the rooftop equipment.
2. Approve a 4' x 8' temporary construction sign on the west (Jackson Street) elevation and a 9' x 35' temporary banner sign on the six floor of the south (12<sup>th</sup> Street) elevation in the same location as the existing banner on the condition that any new sign shall serve principally to announce the future home of the Art Academy.
3. Approve the use of a black chain link fence to secure and enclose the ground-mounted generator finding that it will not be visible from Jackson Street.
4. Grant a zoning variance from Chapter 1427-13 (a) to permit a second temporary construction sign on the building and an 8' fence at the rear of the loading dock finding that such relief from the literal implication of the Zoning Code:
  - a. Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as no to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, AND ZONING VARIANCE, 108 W.  
ELDER STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Urban Conservator Mr. William Forwood presented the staff report regarding an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness and zoning variance for 108 W. Elder St. The rehabilitation will include extending the side wall to form a dormer, constructing a roof deck and a building a 12' high wood privacy fence.

Mr. Forwood stated the wide gable dormer and arched window proposed are not in character with the building or district architecture. Staff recommended that the dormer be redesigned with a shed roof and flat-headed window(s). Staff also recommended that the railing on the new roof deck be metal and to be less visible from the Findlay Market parking lot that it faces.

Contractor Ron Bennett was present to answer questions from the Board. He said he had not attended the pre-hearing and had not seen the staff report, but disagreed with its recommendations.

Mr. Bennett stated that gable dormers can be found throughout the Over-the-Rhine Historic District and that the gable roof allowed a cathedral ceiling in the kitchen of the owner's unit. Mr. Senhauser indicated that it was difficult to evaluate the effect of the dormer since the side wall elevation shows only a portion of the wall and none of the windows on the lower floors. He said he understood the need to raise the roofline, but suggested that the applicant work with staff to redesign a dormer that is compatible with an Italianate building.

Ms. Wallace asked why a 12' high fence was required at the rear property line. Mr. Bennett responded that the fence shielded mechanical equipment mounted on an overhead platform above the areaway between buildings. Mr. Bennett said he would reopen the existing door in the rear building wall as suggested in the staff report.

**BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Kreider, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to take the following actions:

1. Approve a zoning variance to construct a 12' high wood wall and mechanical platform finding that the structure enhances the feasibility of this historic conservation project.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the roof alterations and a roof deck with the following conditions:
  - a. Redesign the dormer and window to reflect the Italianate style of the building and district.
  - b. Install metal railings instead of wood on the rear deck.
  - c. Correct the drawings to reflect retention of the rear door opening.
  - d. Final plans and any revisions are submitted to the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.

**ADJOURNMENT**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: \_\_\_\_\_